TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

1	IN THE WORKERS' COMPENSATION COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA	
2	OF THE STATE OF MONTANA	
3	JEREMY RUHD,) WCC No. 2002-0500 Claimant,)	
4	vs.	
5	LIBERTY NORTHWEST INSURANCE) CORPORATION,) Respondent/Insurer.)	
6		
7	TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS	
8		
9		
10		
11		
12	BE IT REMEMBERED, that the proceedings in the	
13	above-captioned matter was heard before the	
14	Honorable Mike McCarter, at the offices of the	
15	Workers Compensation Court, 1625 Eleventh Avenue,	
16	Helena, Montana, on the 25th day of June, 2003,	
17	beginning at the hour of 11:37 a.m., before Laurie	
18	Crutcher, Registered Professional Reporter, Notary	
19	Public.	
20	* * * *	
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

Page 2	
1	APPEARANCES:
2	APPEARING FOR THE CLAIMANT: MR. GEOFFREY C. ANGEL
3	Attorney at Law 125 W. Mendenhall
4	Bozeman, MT 59715
5	APPEARING FOR LIBERTY NORTHWEST: MR. LARRY W. JONES
6	Attorney at Law 700 S.W. Higgins Ave., Suite 108
7	Missoula, MT 59803-1489
8	APPEARING FOR THE STATE FUND: MR. BRADLEY J. LUCK
9	MR. THOMAS J. HARRINGTON Attorney at Law
10	P.O. Box 7909 Missoula, MT 59807-7909
11	MR. GREG E. OVERTURF
12	Special Assistant Attorney General Montana State Fund
13	P.O. Box 4759 Helena, MT 59604-4759
14	MR. DAVID A. HAWKINS
15	Special Assistant Attorney General Montana State Fund
16	P.O. Box 4759 Helena, MT 59604-4759
17	MR. THOMAS MARTELLO
18	Special Assistant Attorney General Montana State Fund
19	P.O. Box 4759 Helena, MT 59604-4759
20	MS. NANCY BUTLER
21	General Counsel Montana State Fund
22	P.O. Box 4759 Helena, MT 59604-4759
23	
24	
25	

Page 3 1 APPEARANCES (CONTINUED) ALSO PRESENT: MR. MARK CADWALLADER Legal Counsel Department of Labor and Industry 5 Legal Services Division P.O. Box 1728 7 Helena, MT 59624-1728 9 10 MR. DEAN BLACKABY 11 Attorney at Law 303 Ewing 12 Helena, MT 59601 13 14 15 MR. LUCAS J. FOUST 16 Attorney at Law 17 2135 Charlotte St., Suite 1A 18 Bozeman, MT 59718 19 20 MS. CAROL GLEED 21 22 MR. PETER STRAUSS 23 24

25

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

		Page 4			Pag
1	Whereupon, the following proceedings were		1	my intent on that. Has anybody heard from	
2	had:		2	Well, I'll talk to them later today.	
	****		3	MR. ANGEL: I was going to stay for	
	THE COURT: Ruhd, where are we?		4	that.	
	MR. JONES: Your Honor, I think we have		5	THE COURT: You can. You're absolutely	
	some stipulations. Your Honor, I believe we have		6	welcome to stay for that.	
,	the following stipulation. Geoff is not going to		7	MR. LUCK: Last we heard, they were	
3	seek class action certification.		8		
	Secondly, we will follow Geoff is		9	seriously considering filing a writ.	
)	making a common fund claim against Liberty	9	10	THE COURT: They actually could file an	
1				appeal.	
	Northwest, the named carrier in the case. And		11	MR. LUCK: I'm not sure if it's in both	
2	we've agreed to follow the same format as in the		12	cases or one case or how that works.	
3	Wild and Mathews cases of a 45 day period to		13	THE COURT: It'll probably end up	
1	develop relevant information; during which time we		14	I've got a matter before me in that case that	
5	can discuss what we're developing, sharing, see	4.40	15	will probably give them an opportunity to use both	
5	what agreements can be reached; after which, there		16	of them for that case, or in the alternative	
7	will be a deadline you will set for briefs on the		17	they'll probably want to take both cases up on	
3	same issues as in the other cases.		18	appeal. Very good. What have we got next?	
)	And there is a possibility in the Ruhd	17	19	(The proceedings were concluded	
)	case that the FFR attorneys will appeal your		20	at 11:40 a.m.)	
1	decision, in which they were not allowed a common		21	* * * *	
2	fund against Liberty. If that occurs, we		22		
)	nevertheless will proceed with this procedure on	ng 100 4	23		
)					
	the common fund issue, and we will continue to	180	24		
3 4 5	the common fund issue, and we will continue to withhold 25 percent of any moneys paid pursuant to Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the	Page 5	24 25	CERTIFICATE	Pa
4 5 2 3 4 5 7 3 9	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to	Page 5	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and	Pag
	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that	Page 5	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription,	Pa
1 5 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue.	Page 5	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true	Pa
1 5 5 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that.	Page 5	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	: SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true record of the proceedings to the best of my	Pa
1 5 7 5 9 1 2 3 4	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that. MR. ANGEL: I think, as I understood it,	Page 5	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true	Pa
	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that. MR. ANGEL: I think, as I understood it, when they file a notice of appeal, we would still	Page 5	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true record of the proceedings to the best of my ability. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my	Pa
	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that. MR. ANGEL: I think, as I understood it, when they file a notice of appeal, we would still consent if the Court agrees to brief	Page 5	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true record of the proceedings to the best of my ability. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my notarial seal	Pa
	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that. MR. ANGEL: I think, as I understood it, when they file a notice of appeal, we would still consent if the Court agrees to brief retrospectivity, and I think that's what Larry is	Page 5	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true record of the proceedings to the best of my ability. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my notarial seal	Pa
3 1 5 6 7 8 9 9 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that. MR. ANGEL: I think, as I understood it, when they file a notice of appeal, we would still consent if the Court agrees to brief retrospectivity, and I think that's what Larry is saying, my understanding. So we'd still resolve	Page 5	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true record of the proceedings to the best of my ability. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my notarial seal this day of , 2003.	Pa
23455739	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that. MR. ANGEL: I think, as I understood it, when they file a notice of appeal, we would still consent if the Court agrees to brief retrospectivity, and I think that's what Larry is saying, my understanding. So we'd still resolve these issues while that other limited issue is on	Page 5	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true record of the proceedings to the best of my ability. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my notarial seal this day of , 2003. LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR	Pa
4 5 7 8 9 9 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that. MR. ANGEL: I think, as I understood it, when they file a notice of appeal, we would still consent if the Court agrees to brief retrospectivity, and I think that's what Larry is saying, my understanding. So we'd still resolve these issues while that other limited issue is on appeal.	Page 5	25 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true record of the proceedings to the best of my ability. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my notarial seal this day of , 2003. LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR Court Reporter - Notary Public	Pa
3 4 4 5 5 5 5 5 7 7 3 8 9 9 1 1	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that. MR. ANGEL: I think, as I understood it, when they file a notice of appeal, we would still consent if the Court agrees to brief retrospectivity, and I think that's what Larry is saying, my understanding. So we'd still resolve these issues while that other limited issue is on appeal. THE COURT: Right. The only thing I did	Page 5	25 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true record of the proceedings to the best of my ability. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my notarial seal this day of , 2003. LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR Court Reporter - Notary Public My commission expires	Pa
14 14 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15 15	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that. MR. ANGEL: I think, as I understood it, when they file a notice of appeal, we would still consent if the Court agrees to brief retrospectivity, and I think that's what Larry is saying, my understanding. So we'd still resolve these issues while that other limited issue is on appeal. THE COURT: Right. The only thing I did with that I joined the attorneys as intervenors so	Page 5	25 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true record of the proceedings to the best of my ability. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my notarial seal this day of , 2003. LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR Court Reporter - Notary Public	Paş
23455739	Ruhd to Liberty Northwest claimants, and the Courts can tell us who gets it. This will THE COURT: I assume proceeding with payment depending on how I resolve these other issues. MR. JONES: That's exactly right. That's in the future. Just so we're not sitting on that group of cases, we'll move them forward, because if the FFR attorneys prevail, the same information and procedure probably would have to be followed, so why delay. And I think that resolves the Ruhd issue. THE COURT: Okay. I agree with that. MR. ANGEL: I think, as I understood it, when they file a notice of appeal, we would still consent if the Court agrees to brief retrospectivity, and I think that's what Larry is saying, my understanding. So we'd still resolve these issues while that other limited issue is on appeal. THE COURT: Right. The only thing I did	Page 5	25 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	STATE OF MONTANA : SS. COUNTY OF LEWIS & CLARK I, LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR, Court Reporter, Notary Public in and for the County of Lewis & Clark, State of Montana, do hereby certify: That the proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein named; that the proceedings were reported by me in shorthand and transcribed using computer-aided transcription, and that the foregoing -6- pages contain a true record of the proceedings to the best of my ability. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my notarial seal this day of , 2003. LAURIE CRUTCHER, RPR Court Reporter - Notary Public My commission expires	Pa